

**SPEAKING ORDER**

Vide Director General of Police, Punjab, Office Order No. 1077-1114 /E-1(4) dated 12.02.2021, a Central Recruitment Board was constituted for the recruitment of Civilian Support Staff in Bureau of Investigation of Punjab Police.

2. The Recruitment was completed as per the procedure prescribed in the Advertisement No. 05, dated 17.08.2021. The Computer Based Test (CBT) for 9 posts of Civilian Support Staff of PBI was held on 21/22-09-2021 at six TCS iON centres at SAS Nagar, Bathinda, Patiala, Jalandhar and Amritsar. Out of 6894 registered candidates, 5585 candidates appeared in CBT; out of which 4255 candidates qualified in CBT. 1449 candidates category wise were shortlisted for Document Verification. The document verification process was conducted in two phases, first from 05.04.2022 to 09.04.2022 and in the second phase from 08.08.2022 to 09.08.2022. After completion of process the provisional result was published in the Recruitment Portal on 02.11.2022. Subsequently, the revised provisional result was published on 17.03.2023.

3. It is pertinent to mention here that some candidates approached the Hon'ble Punjab & Haryana High Court regarding their non selection. In CWP No. 2973-2023, the Hon'ble Punjab & Haryana High Court passed the following order dated 01.05.2023.

*"Mr. Dhir, on instructions from Mr. Sarabjit, AIG, Litigation, submits that in order to address the grievance raised by the petitioners in the bunch of these writ petitions, the respondent-department has taken a conscious decision to grant an opportunity of personal hearing to each of the petitioners and thereafter take objective decision strictly in accordance with the public notice dated 17.08.2021 and as per law. The said proposal is acceptable to the counsels representing the petitioners. In view of the above, all the petitioners are granted liberty to represent before Chairperson Central Recruitment Board on or before 06.05.2023. On getting such representations, the schedule w.r.t. the hearing would be published by the Recruitment Board on their*

website by 08.05.2023 specifying the date and time slot on which the candidate is required to appear before the Board. Such exercise would be completed by 12.05.2023. Thereafter necessary orders adjudicating upon the grievance raised by the petitioners would be passed on or before 20.05.2023. The orders will also be published on website and will not be served personally to the candidates. Counsel representing the petitioners have consented to this arrangement. The orders passed be produced on the next date of hearing i.e. 24.05.2023."

4. In compliance with the above directions, the schedule for according personal hearing to candidates was uploaded on the Recruitment Portal for the posts of Computer Digital Forensics Officer, Information Technology Officer, Information Technology Assistant (Software), Financial Officer, Assistant Financial Officer, Assistant Forensics Officer and Legal Officer.

5. A personal hearing was accorded to the petitioner candidates by the Chairperson and members of the Board on 8<sup>th</sup>, 9<sup>th</sup> and 10<sup>th</sup> May, 2023, in the office of Special Director General of Police, CAD-cum-Chairperson Central Recruitment Board, Civilian Support Staff, along with the following domain experts:

- |      |   |                        |
|------|---|------------------------|
| i.   | Sh. Prem Kumar Makkar, Chief Manager, SBI                       | Domain Expert, Finance |
| ii.  | Sh. Sumeet Garg, System Manager (DoGR)                          | Domain Expert, IT      |
| iii. | Dr. Priyanka, Assistant Director (Biology) FSL Forensics        | Domain Expert,         |
| iv.  | Dr. Ruchi Sharma, Assistant Director (Toxicology) FSL Forensics | Domain Expert,         |

6. In addition, the Board also gave personal hearing to two candidates Baltesh Singh Bajwa S/o Parampal Singh Bajwa Roll No. 201500005801 and Vipul Nagar S/o Pushpinder Kumar Nagar, Roll No. 201500006229 in compliance of orders of Hon'ble Punjab & Haryana High Court dated 10.05.2023, wherein directions were issued to the Recruitment Board to treat the writ petitions filed by the petitioners as representation and grant them opportunity of personal hearing. Attendance sheet of 47 candidates who appeared before the Recruitment Board is placed at **Annexure-I**.



7. 5 candidates namely Pawan Kumar S/o Om Parkash Roll No. 210500004166, Brij Mohan S/o Bal Ram Roll No. 210500004549, Amandeep Singh Roll No. 210500005631, Krishan Lal S/o Tilak Raj Roll No. 210500004513 and Bhupinder Singh S/o Makhan Singh 210500003102 have in their representation raised objections against experience details of other 17 selected candidates of Information Technology Assistant (Software) post. The Board decided to provide a personal hearing to 15 selected candidates out of 17. Since 2 candidates did not figure in the Merit List, 15 candidates were called for personal hearing on 22<sup>nd</sup> May 2023. After grant of personal hearing, the Board examined the objections raised by the candidates who had filed the writ and clarification provided by affected candidate against whom objections were raised. On review, in the case of 5 candidates out of 15, objections raised by the candidates in writ petitions were agreed to on merits. However, in 10 cases out of 15, the objections raised by the petitioner candidates were not accepted. Accordingly, as a result of the above exercise, the status of acceptance of experience of following 5 candidates against whom valid objections were raised has been changed from Accepted to Rejected:

Sr. No.	Name of the candidate	Roll No.	Post
1.	Junesh Kumar	210500004834	Information Technology Assistant (Software)
2.	Navjot Kaur	210500004555	Information Technology Assistant (Software)
3.	Prabhjot Kaur	210500004945	Information Technology Assistant (Software)
4.	Baljit Singh	210500005027	Information Technology Assistant (Software)
5.	Simranjit Singh Sohal	210500005570	Information Technology Assistant (Software)

Out of 15 candidates, 1 candidate namely Sulakhanmeet Kaur Ghuman, Roll No. 210500004453, withdrew her candidature for the post of Information Technology Assistant (Software) by submitting a declaration that she does not wish to join. Detailed comments of the domain expert in reference to the objections raised against selected candidates for post of Information Technology Assistant (Software) are placed at **Annexure-II**.

8. Ms. Mandeep Kaur D/o Maninder Singh Roll No. 210500005226, a candidate for the post of Information Technology Assistant (Software) appeared before the Board in reference to her non selection in the Persons With Disability (PWD) category. The candidate has a Locomotor disability. There were 9 vacancies of PWD advertised for the post of ITA (S) category. As per instructions contained in Letter No. 1/1/2017-3DC/1588894/1 dated 03.10.2019, Department of Social Security and Women and Child Development (Disability Cell), only 1 out of 4 vacancies of PWD were to be provided to candidates with Locomotor disability whereas the other 3 were to be provided to persons with the following disabilities:

- i. Blindness and Low Vision
- ii. Deaf and Hard of hearing
- iii. Intellectual disability (including Autism and One percent specific learning disability), and Mental illness

Accordingly, Persons with Locomotor disability could be allocated only 2 seat out of 9 vacancies. The 2 vacancies reserved for Locomotor disability candidates were filled in by candidates with Locomotor disability who secured higher marks than the petitioner candidate. Accordingly, no ground was made out for amending the result on this account and her representation has been filed.

9. Candidate Amit Gupta S/o Satpal Gupta, Roll No. 210500004629 was heard in reference to his petition regarding his non selection as Legal Officer against vacancy of PWD for the post of Legal Officer. The contention of the candidate was, that the Department had, in its advertisement dated 17.08.2021, merely specified reservation for Persons With Disability but had not mentioned a specific disability as a sub category. He contended that there were 4 PWD candidates, who were eligible for consideration against the 1 vacancy of Persons with Disability for post of Legal Officer. All the 4 eligible candidates had Locomotor disability and since he had the highest score in the written examination out of these 4 candidates, he should be allocated the vacancy. The Board had complied with the instructions contained in Letter No. 1/1/2017-3DC/1588894/1 dated 03.10.2019, of the Department of Social Security and Women and Child Development whereby the first roster point is allocated to persons with blindness and low vision and since none of the PWD



applicants had this disability, the seat was kept vacant. The Board has requested a clarification on the issue from the Department of Social Security and Women and Child Development and a final decision on this issue can be taken after receipt of reply from the concerned Department, which is awaited.

10. Personal hearing was accorded to 4 applicants for the post of Computer Digital Forensic Officer (CDFO) who contended that their experience should be accepted as relevant. However, on review, after according of personal hearing to the candidates, their claim was rejected by the Board as the candidates did not have experience in the domain of Computer/Digital Forensics which is a niche field requiring specialized skills and experience not possessed by the candidates. Detailed comments of the domain expert are placed at **Annexure-III**.

11. Similarly, personal hearing was accorded to 5 applicants for the post of Information Technology Officer (ITO) who contended that their experience should be accepted as relevant. 1 candidate Bhupinder Singh S/o Makhan Singh Roll No. 210500003102 did not appear in personal hearing. On review and after grant of personal hearing, the claim of 2 candidates was accepted as being relevant work experience whereas the claim of 4 candidates was rejected by the Board on the basis of the comments of the domain expert. Detailed comments of the domain expert are placed at **Annexure-IV**.

12. Further, personal hearing was accorded to 26 applicants for the posts of Information Technology Assistant (Software) who contended that their experience should be accepted as relevant. On review and after grant of personal hearing, the claim of 7 candidates was accepted whereas the claim of 15 candidates was rejected by the Board on the basis of the comments of the domain expert. Detailed comments of the Domain Expert are placed at **Annexure-V**.

13. Similarly, a personal hearing was accorded to 2 applicants for the post of Assistant Forensic Officer who contended that their experience may be considered as relevant. On review, their claim was rejected by the Board on the basis of the comments of the domain expert. The details of the comments of Domain Experts are enclosed as **Annexure-VI**.

14. The Recruitment Board accorded a personal hearing to 3 petitioner candidates for the post of Financial Officer and 11 candidates for the post of Assistant Financial Officer. During personal hearing of candidates who were rejected on account of inability to prove payment of salary by cash, it was argued by the concerned candidate that they had submitted all relevant documents including experience certificate and merely the fact that they had received salary in cash should not disqualify them specially since they had secured higher marks than cut off. In order to give a fair chance to the aforementioned candidates, it was decided by the Board to allow such candidates to produce a certificate signed by CA certifying that such candidates had received cash salary during the relevant period of experience claimed, provided such certificate was supported by a UDIN Number. However, if such opportunity was provided to petitioner candidates, it was also necessary to provide same opportunity to all such similarly placed candidates who had been rejected on the same ground, although such candidates had obtained above cut off marks. Accordingly, all such candidates were emailed to provide the relevant documents as last opportunity in support of their experience. On the basis of examination of the documents submitted by the aforementioned candidates, the Board accepted the experience submitted by 12 candidates for post of Assistant Financial Officer. However, on review of the representations by candidates for post of Financial Officer, representations in 3 cases were rejected based on comments of domain expert while the written score of fourth candidate was well below the cut off marks. The detailed comments of the financial domain expert for the posts of Financial Officer and Assistant Financial Officer are annexed as **Annexure-VII**.

15. As per para 8.3 of advertisement no. 5 of 2021 for recruitment of Civilian Support Staff in Punjab Bureau of Investigation published on 17.08.2021, first Appellate Authority for any kind of appeal for all posts under the Civilian Support Staff is IGP Administration, BoI. The Recruitment Board has received about 50 references from IGP Administration, BoI for its comments on appeals submitted by candidates against their non selection. The Board is also examining such representations. In addition to the changes in the provisional result based on



the decisions taken by the Board on writs/representations filed in the Hon'ble Punjab & Haryana High Court and referred to the Board by Hon'ble Punjab & Haryana High Court, additional changes on basis of decision of such representations referred by BoI shall also be incorporated while compiling the revised provisional Merit List.

16. Further, it was brought to the notice of the Board that 9 selected candidates who figured in the Merit List in the post of Financial Officer/ Assistant Financial Officer/Information Technology Assistant (Software) have submitted their written applications intimating the Department that they do not wish to join. Since, the provisional Merit List is likely to be revised in compliance of the orders of Hon'ble Punjab & Haryana High Court, it will be in fitness of things to not consider the names of such candidates in the revised provisional Merit List. The list of such candidates is attached as **Annexure-VIII**.

17. On account of the above exercise, list of candidates whose experience has been accepted or rejected, on review by the Board in compliance of directions issue by the Hon'ble Punjab & Haryana High Court vide order dated 01.05.2023 is as follows:

(i)

Name of the Candidates whose experience has been accepted, on review by the Recruitment Board.			
Sr. No.	Post	Name	Roll No.
1.	Information Technology Officer	Manish Kumar S/o Tarlochan Kumar	210500001870
2.	-do-	Manjinder Singh	210500000494
3.	Information Technology Assistant (Software)	Ayusha Sehgal	210500004759
4.	-do-	Zeenat Begam	210500005333
5.	-do-	Vivek Singh	210500005611
6.	-do-	Shiv Kumar	210500005526
7.	-do-	Deepak Mehta	210500004952

8.	-do-	Neetu Singh S/o Darshan Singh	210500005527
9.	-do-	Shiv Kumar	210500003948
10.	<b>Assistant Financial Officer</b>	Sunny Bind	210500006136
11.	-do-	Tavtarnvir Singh	210500006325
12.	-do-	Hardeep Singh	210500005927
13.	-do-	Pushpinder Singh	210500006037
14.	-do-	Karan Kumar	210500006195
15.	-do-	Kanwar Anmol Singh Sabharwal	210500006154
16.	-do-	Isha Shukla	210500006705
17.	-do-	Shubham Bansal	210500006432
18.	-do-	Mantabya Mathur	210500006490
19.	-do-	Vipul Nagar	210500006229
20.	-do-	Munish Jindal	210500006681
21.	-do-	Richa Furmaha	210500006248


(ii)

Name of the Candidates whose experience stands rejected, on review by the Recruitment Board.

Sr. No.	Post	Name	Roll No.
1.	<b>Computer Digital Forensic Officer</b>	Abinash Singla	210500006755
2.	-do-	Jaspal Singh	210500006795
3.	-do-	Baljinder Singh	210500006808
4.	-do-	Junesh Kumar	210500006796
5.	<b>Information Technology Officer</b>	Vinod Agnihotri	210500000498
6.	-do-	Rajni	210500001858
7.	-do-	Junesh Kumar	210500002361
8.	-do-	Bhupinder Singh	210500003102
9.	<b>Information Technology Assistant (Software)</b>	Vinod Agnihotri	210500004017
10.	-do-	Rajni	210500004207
11.	-do-	Raman Kumar	210500004936
12.	-do-	Rahul Sulakhia	210500004866
13.	-do-	Navjot Kaur	210500004014
14.	-do-	Amandeep	210500005019



15.	-do-	Vishant Sharma	210500004385
16.	-do-	Harjot Kaur	210500004380
17.	-do-	Jaskaran Singh	210500003917
18.	-do-	Manjit Kumar	210500005606
19.	-do-	Sursumel Singh	210500005636
20.	-do-	Sherpal Kaur	210500004583
21.	-do-	Bhupinder Singh	210500004432
22.	-do-	Manjit Kaur	210500005581
23.	-do-	Mandeep Kaur	210500005226
24.	-do-	Baljit Singh	210500005027
25.	-do-	Simranjit Singh Sohal	210500005570
26.	-do-	Navjot Kaur	210500004555
27.	-do-	Junesh Kumar	210500004834
28.	-do-	Prabhjot Kaur	210500004945
29.	<b>Financial Officer</b>	Varun Sharma	210500006875
30.	-do-	Karan Sharma	210500006874
31.	-do-	Lalit Kumar Ahuja	210500006759
32.	-do-	Manpreet	210500006800
33.	<b>Assistant Financial Officer</b>	Vivek Sharma	210500006134
34.	-do-	Varun Sharma	210500006613
35.	-do-	Rakesh Kumar	210500006231
36.	-do-	Harsimran Kaur	210500006493
37.	-do-	Karan Sharma	210500006644
38.	-do-	Baltesh Singh Bajwa	210500005801
39.	-do-	Gajjan Singh	210500005775
40.	-do-	Manpreet	210500006199
41.	-do-	Nikhil Arora	210500005820
42.	-do-	Ramanpreet Kaur	210500006518
43.	-do-	Amandeep Kaur	210500006667
44.	-do-	Abhi Arora	210500005869
45.	<b>Assistant Forensic Officer</b>	Loverpreet Kaur	210500006120
46.	-do-	Harinder Kaur	210500006219

  
 Gurpreet Deo, IPS  
 Spl. DGP CAD-cum-Chairperson,  
 Central Recruitment Board,  
 CSS, BoI, Punjab.

26/5/2023