

**Detailed comments of Domain Experts in case of representations filed by candidates where personal hearing granted by the Board  
in compliance of directions of Hon'ble Punjab & Haryana High Court**

**FINANCIAL OFFICER (FO)**

Sr. No.	Name of the candidate	Roll No	CWP No.	Comments of Domain Expert
1.	Varun Sharma s/o Sh. Satpal Sharma r/o B/36/205, Roop Chand Street, Near Bartan Bazar, Patiala (EWS)  CPO Circular Br Diary No. 6786 dated 15.11.2022	210500006875	2100/2023	<p>Earlier the experience certificate submitted by the candidate was not accepted as it was provided by entities such as shopkeeper/Advocate. The candidate was given the opportunity to submit the supporting documents statement where the salary was being credited like Bank account statement, form-16, ESI/EPF statement etc. to prove the genuineness of the experience submitted. But the candidate couldn't provide any of the mentioned documents.</p> <p>Now it was decided by the board to allow an additional document i.e., UDIN based CA certificate, certifying the cash payment of salary details corresponding to the period of experience. The candidate has submitted two UDIN based CA certificate certifying the cash payment of salary details from 01.12.2009 to 31.03.2017 i.e., for a period of 7 years and 4 months and from 01.05.2017 to 31.03.2022(4 Years 3 Months).</p> <p>There is a material discrepancy pertaining to the length of experience in the UDIN based CA certificate certifying the cash payment of salary details from 01.12.2009 to 31.03.2017 i.e., for a period of 7 years and 4 months, submitted to the board, and the one downloaded, by the board with the help of domain expert, from the online portal of "The Indian Institute of Chartered Accountant". For The second experience certificate for the period of 4 Years 3 Months the candidate had mentioned in his original application the experience of working as Tax Consultant and for the post of financial officer the work experience of tax consultant is irrelevant as it was not in the eligibility criteria.</p> <p>Therefore, on account of the above the experience provided by the candidate may be rejected.</p>
2.	Karan Sharma S/o Satpal Sharma R/o B/36/205, Roop Chand Street, Near bartan bazaar Patiala  CPO Circular Br Diary No.	210500006874	2100/2023	<p>Earlier the experience certificate submitted by the candidate was not accepted as it was provided by entities such as shopkeeper/Advocate. The candidate was given the opportunity to submit the supporting documents statement where the salary was being credited like Bank account statement, form-16, ESI/EPF statement etc. to prove the genuineness of the experience submitted. But the candidate couldn't provide any of the mentioned documents.</p> <p>Now it was decided by the board to allow an additional document i.e. UDIN based CA certificate, certifying the cash payment of salary details corresponding to the period of experience. The candidate has submitted two UDIN based CA certificate certifying the cash payment of salary details from 01.12.2009 to 31.07.2014 i.e. for a period of 4 years 08 months , from June 2017 to 01.03.2019 (01 Years 8 Months 21 days) and from March-2019 to date of Application (02 Years 05 Months)</p> <p>There is a material discrepancy pertaining to the length of experience in the UDIN based CA certificate certifying the cash payment of salary details from 01.12.2009 to 31.07.2014 i.e. for a period of 4 years 8 months, submitted to the board, and the one downloaded, by the board with the help of domain expert, from the online portal of "The Indian Institute of Chartered Accountant" .The second experience certificate is only for</p>

Sr. No.	Name of the candidate	Roll No	CWP No.	Comments of Domain Expert
	6784 dated 15.11.2022			<p>the period of 01 Years 08 Months and 21 days of working as finance and tax consultant .The 3<sup>rd</sup> experience is of an advocate and tax consultant is irrelevant experience for the post of financial officer.</p> <p>Therefore, on account of the above the experience certificates provided by the candidate may be rejected.</p>
3.	Lalit Kumar Ahuja	210500006759	2973/2023	The Candidate is well below the cut-off marks in his category, so the verification process of experience related documents is irrelevant.
4.	Manpreet	210500006800	--	<p>Earlier the experience certificate submitted by the candidate, working under a CA, was not accepted as it was without any supporting documents. The candidate was given the opportunity to submit the supporting documents statement where the salary was being credited like Bank account statement, form-16, ESI/EPF statement etc. to prove the genuineness of the experience submitted. But the candidate couldn't provide any of the mentioned documents.</p> <p>Now it was decided by the board to allow an additional document i.e. UDIN based CA certificate, certifying the cash payment of salary details corresponding to the period of experience. The candidate has submitted a UDIN based CA certificate certifying the cash payment of salary details from 03.02.2010 to 30.11.2018 i.e. for a period of 08 years and 09 months.</p> <p>There is a material discrepancy pertaining to the length of experience in the UDIN based CA certificate certifying the cash payment of salary details from 03.02.2010 to 30.11.2018 i.e. for a period of 08 years and 09 months, submitted to the board, and the one downloaded, by the board with the help of domain expert, from the online portal of "The Indian Institute of Chartered Accountant".</p> <p>Therefore, on account of the above the experience provided by the candidate may be rejected.</p>

**Detailed comments of Domain Experts in case of representations filed by candidates where personal hearing granted by the Board in compliance of directions of Hon'ble Punjab & Haryana High Court**

**ASSISTANT FINANCIAL OFFICER (AFO)**

<b>Sr. No.</b>	<b>Name of the candidate</b>	<b>Roll No</b>	<b>CWP No.</b>	<b>Comments of Domain Expert</b>
1.	Pushpinder Singh s/o Jaswinder Singh r/o VPO Jorki Andhe wali, teh. & district Fazilka.	210500006037 CWP (7) 27125 LN	6517/2023	<p>The candidate has provided UDIN( UDIN: ) based CA certificate, from M/S MKJ &amp; Associates, certifying the cash salary payment details for FY 2018-19 and FY 2019-20 of working as accountant with M/s MKJ &amp; Associates . The certificate has been verified online and found in order.</p> <p>During personal hearing the candidate has also submitted an Article ship certificate of 3 years completed by him on 24/04/2017 commencing from 2014.</p> <p>Hence the experience of the candidate for the post of assistant financial officer may now be accepted.</p>
2.	Vivek Sharma r/o ED-42, Dhau Mohalla, Jalandhar (EWS)	210500006134	--	<p>Earlier the experience certificate submitted by the candidate , working under a CA, was not accepted as it was without any supporting documents. The candidate was given the opportunity to submit the supporting documents statement where the salary was being credited like Bank account statement, form-16, ESI/EPF statement etc. to prove the genuineness of the experience submitted. But the candidate couldn't provide any of the mentioned documents.</p> <p>Now it was decided by the board to allow an additional document i.e. UDIN based CA certificate, certifying the cash payment of salary details corresponding to the period of experience. The candidate has submitted a UDIN based CA certificate certifying the cash payment of salary details from 04.09.2017 to 07.04.2020 i.e. for a period of 02 years and 07 months .</p> <p>There is a material discrepancy pertaining to the length of experience in the UDIN based CA certificate certifying the cash payment of salary details from 04.09.2017 to 07.04.2020 i.e. for a period of 02 years and 07 months, submitted to the board, and the one downloaded, by the board with the help of domain expert, from the online portal of "The Indian Institute of Chartered Accountant" . Hence on account of the above the experience certificate provided by the candidate may be rejected.</p>
3.	Varun Sharma s/o Sh. Satpal Sharma r/o B/36/205, Roop Chand Street, Near Bartan Bazar, Patiala (EWS)	210500006613	2100/2023	<p>Earlier the experience certificate submitted by the candidate was not accepted as it was provided by entities such as shopkeeper/Advocate. The candidate was given the opportunity to submit the supporting documents statement where the salary was being credited like Bank account statement, form-16, ESI/EPF statement etc. to prove the genuineness of the experience submitted. But the candidate couldn't provide any of the mentioned documents.</p> <p>Now it was decided by the board to allow an additional document i.e. UDIN based CA certificate, certifying the cash payment of salary details corresponding to the period of experience. The candidate has submitted two UDIN based CA certificate certifying the cash payment of salary details from 01.12.2009 to 31.03.2017 i.e. for a period of 7 years and 4 months and from 01.05.2017 to 31.03.2022(4 Years 3 Months).</p>

Sr. No.	Name of the candidate	Roll No	CWP No.	Comments of Domain Expert
				<p>There is a material discrepancy pertaining to the length of experience in the UDIN based CA certificate certifying the cash payment of salary details from 01.12.2009 to 31.03.2017 i.e. for a period of 7 years and 4 months, submitted to the board, and the one downloaded, by the board with the help of domain expert, from the online portal of "The Indian Institute of Chartered Accountant" . For The second experience certificate for the period of 4 Years 3 Months the candidate had mentioned in his original application the experience of working as Tax Consultant and for the post of assistant financial officer the work experience of tax consultant is irrelevant as it was not in the eligibility criteria.</p> <p>Therefore, on account of the above the experience provided by the candidate may be rejected.</p>
4.	Rakesh Kumar S/o Ram Dass R/o Vill Bani lodhi, P.O Sunder chak, Tehsil and Distt Pathankot	210500006231	--	<p>The experience certificate issued by M/s Kiran Foreign Trade Pvt Ltd from 05<sup>th</sup> October-2010 to 13<sup>th</sup> October 2012. As a supporting document the Candidate has only submitted a bank account statement where the salary proceeds are from May-2011 to September-2012 i.e. for 15 months only so the document provided is inadequate to establish the length of experience corresponding to the minimum requirement of 2 years(24 months)</p> <p>Hence the experience of the candidate for the post of assistant financial officer is short of length and It may be rejected.</p>
5.	Karan Kumar S/o Vijay Kumar R/o Barian kalan, Distt Hoshiarpur	210500006195	9398/2023	<p>Earlier the experience certificate, working in shop, submitted by the candidate was not accepted.</p> <p>Now it was decided by the board to allow an additional document i.e. UDIN based CA certificate, certifying the cash payment of salary details corresponding to the period of experience. The experience certificate is provided by a shopkeeper by M/S NRDS Enterprises of working as an accountant in the firm from 2017 to date of application i.e. for 04 years dully supported with bank statement for the period December-2018 to August-2021.</p> <p>Hence the experience of the candidate for the post of assistant financial officer may now be accepted.</p>
6.	Harsimran Kaur d/o Narinder Singh r/o H.No. 13A, Oasis Green Society, Highland Marg, Zirakpur, district Mohali.	210500006493 CWP (7) 27125 LN		<p>Earlier the experience certificate, working in college, submitted by the candidate was not accepted as it was provided without supporting documents. The candidate was given the opportunity to submit the supporting documents statement where the salary was being credited like Bank account statement, form-16, ESI/EPF statement etc. to prove the genuineness of the experience submitted. But the candidate couldn't provide any of the mentioned documents.</p> <p>Now it was decided by the board to allow an additional document i.e. UDIN based CA certificate, certifying the cash payment of salary details corresponding to the period of experience. The candidate has submitted a UDIN based CA certificate certifying the cash payment of salary details from 01.04.2018 to 31.12.2020 i.e. for a period of 02 years and 9 months.</p> <p>There is a material discrepancy pertaining to the length of experience in the UDIN based CA certificate certifying the cash payment of salary details from 01.04.2018 to 31.12.2020 i.e. for a period of 02 years and 09 months, submitted to the board, and the one downloaded, by the board with the help of domain expert, from the online portal of "The Indian Institute of Chartered Accountant" .</p> <p>Hence on account of the above the experience certificate provided by the candidate may be rejected.</p>

Sr. No.	Name of the candidate	Roll No	CWP No.	Comments of Domain Expert
7.	Kanwar Anmol Singh Sabharwal S/o Gurmeet Singh R/o H.No 1 Sant Nagar, Near Devi Talab Gurudwara Kapurthala City CPO Circular Br Diary No. 6770 dated 15.11.2022	210500006154	--	<p>The candidate has provided UDIN based CA certificate certifying the cash salary payment details from 01.04.2018 to 01/12/2020 i.e. for a period of 02 years and 4 months of working as accountant at M/s Varun Mitra.</p> <p>The Certificate has been verified online, with the help of domain expert, through the portal of The Institute of Chartered Accountants of India and found in order.</p> <p>Hence the experience of the candidate for the post of assistant financial officer may now be accepted.</p>
8.	Isha Shukla D/o Narinder Sharma	210500006705	8835/2023	<p>The experience certificate issued by The Patiala District. CO-OP Milk Producers union Limited is from 08-12-2016 to date of joining as clerk cum typist and in the same certificate it was also mentioned that candidate was also assigned the duty of accountant as assistant executive from 24/01/ 2019 to date of application ( 02 Years 05 Months) which was inadvertently overlooked Now on the basis of above facts and supporting documents i.e. bank statement corresponding to the length of experience the experience certificate of the candidate for the post of assistant financial officer may now be accepted.</p>
9.	Karan Sharma S/o Satpal Sharma R/o B/36/205, Roop Chand Street, Near bartan bazaar Patiala	210500006644	2100/2023	<p>Earlier the experience certificate submitted by the candidate was not accepted as it was provided by entities such as shopkeeper/Advocate. The candidate was given the opportunity to submit the supporting documents statement where the salary was being credited like Bank account statement, form-16, ESI/EPF statement etc. to prove the genuineness of the experience submitted. But the candidate couldn't provide any of the mentioned documents.</p> <p>Now it was decided by the board to allow an additional document i.e. UDIN based CA certificate, certifying the cash payment of salary details corresponding to the period of experience. The candidate has submitted two UDIN based CA certificate certifying the cash payment of salary details from 01.12.2009 to 31.07.2014 i.e. for a period of 4 years 08 months , from June 2017 to 01.03.2019 (01 Years 8 Months 21 days) and from March-2019 to date of Application (02 Years 05 Months)</p> <p>There is a material discrepancy pertaining to the length of experience in the UDIN based CA certificate certifying the cash payment of salary details from 01.12.2009 to 31.07.2014 i.e. for a period of 4 years 8 months, submitted to the board, and the one downloaded, by the board with the help of domain expert, from the online portal of "The Indian Institute of Chartered Accountant" .The second experience certificate is only for the period of 01 Years 08 Months and 21 days of working as finance and tax consultant .The 3<sup>rd</sup> experience of an advocate and tax consultant is irrelevant experience for the post of assistant financial officer.</p> <p>Therefore, on account of the above the experience certificates provided by the candidate may be rejected.</p>

Sr. No.	Name of the candidate	Roll No	CWP No.	Comments of Domain Expert
10.	Shubham Bansal s/o BhimSain r/o H.No. 2626, Street No. 1, Aggarwal Colony, Gidderbaha district Sri Muktsar Sahib.	210500006432 CWP (7) 2712 LN	--	<p>The candidate has provided a UDIN based CA certificate certifying the cash salary payment details from 01.06.2019 to 30.06.2021 i.e. for a period of 02 years and 03 months of working as accountant with M/s Shivas Nagpal &amp; Associates.</p> <p>The Certificate has been verified online, with the help of domain expert, through the portal of The Institute of Chartered Accountants of India and found in order.</p> <p>Hence the experience of the candidate for the post of assistant financial officer may now be accepted.</p>
11.	Mantabya Mathur r/o 1846/1, phase-10, Mohali.	210500006490 CWP(8) 25713	25713/2022 4130/2023 4132/2023 4133/2023	<p>As per the application submitted by candidate in the experience column the experience mentioned from 20/08/2018 to 06/09/2021 is for working in Gretis India Pvt Ltd but for verification another experience certificate, issued by Secretary Punjab State Sports Council for the same period has been submitted.</p> <p>The candidate has now submitted a document, issued by Secretary Punjab State Sports Council, certifying that she was working with Punjab State Sports Council as an accountant from 20.08.2018 to 06.09.2021 on contract basis and she was appointed through M/s Gretis India Pvt Ltd. The supporting document i.e. bank account statement corresponding to the experience certificate has been verified.</p> <p>Hence the experience certificates of the candidate for the post of assistant financial officer may now be accepted.</p>
12.	Vipul Nagar S/o Pushpinder Kumar Nagar, r/o H.No. 180 Basti Nau, Jalandhar. CPO Circular Br Diary No. 6847, dated: 15.11.2022	210500006229	--	<p>1.The Experience of employment in Capital Local Area Bank from 04/02/2013 to 09/07/2014 is for 1 Year 5 Months and 05 Days only dully supported with bank account statement.</p> <p>2.The candidate has provided UDIN based CA certificate certifying the cash salary payment details from 02.09.2020 to 18.08.2021 i.e. for a period of 11 months of working as accountant with M/S Balson International a firm dealing in Paints and Hardware.</p> <p>The Certificate has been verified online, with the help of domain expert, through the portal of The Institute of Chartered Accountants of India and found in order.</p> <p>Hence the experience certificates of the candidate for the post of assistant financial officer may now be accepted.</p>
13.	Munish Jindal s/o Vijay Jindal r/o H.No. 729, W.No. 16, Marasiyan Wali Gali, Jawahrke road, district Mansa.	210500006681 CWP (7) 27125 LN	--	<p>The candidate has provided UDIN based CA certificate certifying the cash salary payment details from 01.08.2019 to 31.08.2021 i.e. for a period of 02 years and 01 months of working as assistant with M/s Sanjeev Amar &amp; Associates.</p> <p>The Certificate has been verified online, with the help of domain expert, through the portal of The Institute of Chartered Accountants of India and found in order.</p> <p>Hence the experience certificate of the candidate for the post of assistant financial officer may now be accepted.</p>

Sr. No.	Name of the candidate	Roll No	CWP No.	Comments of Domain Expert
14.	Richa Furmaha D/o Raj Kumar	210500006248 CWP (8) 25610	25610/2022 4163/2023 4164/2023	The candidate has provided UDIN based CA certificate certifying the cash salary payment details from 01.01.2019 to 31/03/2021 i.e. for a period of 02 years and 2 months of working as accountant Assistant at M/s Anoop Joshi & Associates. The Certificate has been verified online, with the help of domain expert, through the portal of The Institute of Chartered Accountants of India and found in order. Hence the experience certificate of the candidate for the post of assistant financial officer may now be accepted.
15.	Baltesh Singh Bajwa S/o Parmpal Singh Bajwa	210500005801	10144/2023	Earlier the experience certificate submitted by the candidate, working under a builder, was not accepted. Now it was decided by the board to allow an additional document i.e. UDIN based CA certificate, certifying the cash payment of salary details corresponding to the period of experience. The candidate has submitted a UDIN based CA certificate certifying the cash payment of salary details from 16.06.2019 to 31.07.2021 i.e. for a period of 02 years and 1 month.  There is a material discrepancy pertaining to the UDIN based CA certificate certifying the cash payment of salary details from 16.06.2019 to 31.07.2021 i.e. for a period of 02 years and 01 month, submitted to the board, and the one downloaded, by the board with the help of domain expert, from the online portal of "The Indian Institute of Chartered Accountant" .  Therefore on account of the above the experience certificate provided by the candidate may be rejected.
16.	Gajjan Singh S/o Balwinder Singh	210500005775	7526/2023	The Candidate is well below the cut off marks in his category, so the verification process of experience related documents is irrelevant.
17.	Hardeep Singh	210500005927	--	Earlier the experience certificate submitted by the candidate, working in a school, was not accepted as it was without any supporting documents. Now the Candidate has submitted experience certificate from 01-09-2017 to 30-09-2019 and from 15-09-2020 to 31-12-2020 i.e. for a period of 2 years and 04 months of working as accountant cum data entry operator with M/s BZSFS Sr Sec School duly supported with bank account statement from December-2018 to December -2021 along with EPFO statement for FY 2017-18, 2018-19, 2019-20 and 2020-21.  Hence the experience certificate of the candidate for the post of assistant financial officer may now be accepted.
18.	Manpreet	210500006199	--	Earlier the experience certificate submitted by the candidate, working under a CA, was not accepted as it was without any supporting documents. The candidate was given the opportunity to submit the supporting documents statement where the salary was being credited like Bank account statement, form-16, ESI/EPF statement etc. to prove the genuineness of the experience submitted. But the candidate couldn't provide any of the mentioned documents. Now it was decided by the board to allow an additional document i.e. UDIN based CA certificate, certifying the cash payment of salary details corresponding to the period of experience. The candidate has submitted a UDIN based CA certificate certifying the cash payment of salary details from 03.02.2010 to 30.11.2018 i.e. for a period of 08 years and 09 months .

Sr. No.	Name of the candidate	Roll No	CWP No.	Comments of Domain Expert
				There is a material discrepancy pertaining to the UDIN based CA certificate certifying the cash payment of salary details from 03.02.2010 to 30.11.2018 i.e. for a period of 08 years and 09 months, submitted to the board, and the one downloaded, by the board with the help of domain expert, from the online portal of "The Indian Institute of Chartered Accountant". Therefore, on account of the above the experience provided by the candidate may be rejected.
19.	Nikhil Arora	210500005820	--	The candidate has provided UDIN based CA certificate certifying the cash salary payment details from 08.11.2018 to 31.08.2021 i.e. for a period of 02 years and 00 months of working as accountant with M/s Guru Kirpa Milk Bar.  The experience of working at a milk bar does not establish performing <b>of</b> any major account related responsibilities, therefore it is irrelevant to the post of assistant financial officer. Therefore, on account of the above the experience provided by the candidate may be rejected.
20.	Ramanpreet Kaur	210500006518	--	No supporting document provided afresh out of the prescribed documents. Only repetition of earlier documents is there which are inadequate to establish the minimum required length of experience of 24 months.  Therefore, on account of the above the experience provided by the candidate may be rejected.
21.	Sunny Bind	210500006136	--	Candidate has submitted UDIN Based certifying the cash salary payment details from 01.04.2017 to 31.08.2020 i.e. for a period of 03 years and 005 months of working as accountant with M/s Shyam S Gupta & Company.  The Certificate has been verified online, with the help of domain expert, through the portal of The Institute of Chartered Accountants of India and found in order. Hence the experience of the candidate for the post of assistant financial officer may now be accepted.
22.	Tavtarnvir Singh	210500006325	--	The candidate has provided certifying the cash salary payment details from 01.11.2017 to 31.12.2021 i.e. for a period of 03 years and 06 months of working as accountant with M/s B S Khalsa Public S S School (As application the name of experience organization is Brilliant Minds International School).  There is a discrepancy regarding experience issuing institute i.e. experience mentioned in application is from Brilliant Minds International School however salary payment certificate certified by CA is for B S Khalsa Public S S School.  As per clarification provided by the candidate the name of experience issuing authority has been changed from B S Khalsa Sr Sec School to Brilliant Minds International School w.e.f. 01 <sup>st</sup> June 2021.  Hence the experience of the candidate for the post of assistant financial officer may now be accepted.



Sr. No.	Name of the candidate	Roll No	CWP No.	Comments of Domain Expert
23.	Amandeep Kaur	210500006667	--	<p>Earlier the experience certificate submitted by the candidate, working under a CA, was not accepted as it was without any supporting documents. The candidate was given the opportunity to submit the supporting documents statement where the salary was being credited like Bank account statement, form-16, ESI/EPF statement etc. to prove the genuineness of the experience submitted. But the candidate couldn't provide any of the mentioned documents.</p> <p>Now it was decided by the board to allow an additional document i.e. UDIN based CA certificate, certifying the cash payment of salary details corresponding to the period of experience. The candidate has submitted a UDIN based CA certificate certifying the cash payment of salary details from 04.06.2018 to 02.07.2020 i.e. for a period of 02 years .</p> <p>There is a material discrepancy pertaining to the UDIN based CA certificate certifying the cash payment of salary details from 04.06.2018 to 02.07.2020 i.e. for a period of 02 years, submitted to the board, and the one downloaded, by the board with the help of domain expert, from the online portal of "The Indian Institute of Chartered Accountant" .</p> <p>Therefore, on account of the above the experience provided by the candidate may be rejected.</p>
24.	Abhi Arora	210500005869	--	<p>Candidate has submitted experience certificate from 05.09.2015 to 22.01.2018 i.e. for a period of 02 years and 04 months of working as clerk with M/s Suresh Sethi &amp; Associates. The candidate completed his degree of graduation in June 2017 so the period of experience after attaining the minimum required qualification is of 06 months only which is less than the minimum requirement of 02 years(24 months)</p> <p>Hence the experience of the candidate for the post of assistant financial officer may be rejected <b>being less than the minimum requirement of 02 years (24 months).</b></p>